

# Four-loop QCD renormalization group functions with different fermion representations of the gauge group

M. F. Zoller

in collaboration with K. G. Chetyrkin

arXiv:1704.04209 JHEP 1610 (2016) 118 [arXiv:1608.08982]

LoopFest XVI – Argonne National Laboratory, USA – 02/06/2017

#### Outline

- I. Motivation: Higher order RG functions
- II. Extension of QCD to reducible fermion representations
- III. Calculation of four-loop RG functions
- IV. Results
- V. Conclusion

# I. Renormalization Group (RG) functions to higher orders

- RG functions are fundamental QFT quantities. Evolution of model parameters with renormalization scale used as input in many calculations.
- $\beta$ -function  $\rightarrow$  ingredient for Sequential extended BLM approach [Brodsky, Lepage and Mackenzie; Mikhailov; Kataev et al] and Principle of Maximum Conformality and Commensurate Scale Relations [Brodsky et al]:

Observable = 
$$\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \alpha_s^n(\mu) c_n$$
,  $\beta(\alpha_s) = \alpha_s \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \alpha_s^n(\mu) \beta_n$   
 $\Rightarrow c_1 = c_1[0]$   
 $c_2 = c_2[1] \beta_1 + c_2[0]$   
 $c_3 = c_3[2] \beta_1^2 + c_3[0, 1] \beta_2 + c_3[1] \beta_1 + c_3[0] \dots$ 

Try to unambiguously identify  $\beta$ -terms in a pQCD expansion, e. g. by  $n_f$ -terms  $(\beta_1 \text{ identified by } x = \frac{4}{3}T_F n_f \text{ and/or } y = \frac{4}{3}\frac{C_A}{2}n_{\tilde{g}}$  [Mikhailov (2017)]) and absorb  $\beta_n$  into scale  $\mu$  order by order in pQCD.  $\Rightarrow$  Come as close as possible to conformal series with  $\beta = 0$ .

 Gauge boson and ghost propagator anomalous dimensions → ingredients in comparing momentum dependence of corresponding propagators derived in lattice calculations with perturbative results [Suman et al; Becirevic et al; von Smekal et al; Blossier et al; Bornyakov et al].

#### Anomalous dimensions and $\beta$ -functions at higher orders

- **QCD**  $\beta$ -function:  $\beta_{\alpha_s}(\alpha_s)$  at **5** loop [Baikov, Chetyrkin, Kühn (2017)];  $\beta_{\alpha_s}(\alpha_s)$  at **4** loop [van Ritbergen, Vermaseren, Larin (1997); Czakon (2005)];  $\beta_{\alpha_s}(\alpha_s, y_t, \lambda)$  [A. Bednyakov, A. Pikelner (2015); M.Z. (2015)]
- Quark mass and field anomalous dimensions: general gauge group at 5 loop [Luthe, Maier, Marquard Schröder (2016); Baikov, Chetyrkin, Kühn (2017)];
   All QCD anomalous dimensions at 5 loop [Luthe, Maier, Marquard Schröder, 2017]; at 4 loop [Chetyrkin, 2004];
- All SM β-functions and anomalous dimensions at 3 loop [Mihaila, Salomon, Steinhauser (2012); Bednyakov, Pikelner, Velizhanin (2012,2013); Chetyrkin, M.Z. (2012,2013)]

Beyond the SM:

- QCD plus gluinos (Majorana fermions) β-function at 4 loop [M.Z. (2016); Bednyakov, Pikelner (2016)]; at 3 loop [Clavelli, Coulter, Surguladze (1996)]
- General gauge group with any number of fermion representations:  $\beta$ -function at 4 loop [M.Z. (2016)]; All anomalous dimensions [Chetyrkin, M.Z. (2017)] including full  $\xi$ -dependence.

 $\Rightarrow arXiv:1704.04209;$ JHEP 1610 (2016) 118 [arXiv:1608.08982] Results as Mathematica code given in source files of arXiv:1704.04209

#### **II.** Extension of QCD to reducible fermion representations

$$\mathcal{L}_{QCD} = -\frac{1}{4} G^{a}_{\mu\nu} G^{a\,\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2(1-\xi)} \left(\partial_{\mu} A^{a\,\mu}\right)^{2} + \partial_{\mu} \bar{c}^{a} \partial^{\mu} c^{a} + g_{s} f^{abc} \partial_{\mu} \bar{c}^{a} A^{b\,\mu} c^{c} + \sum_{q=1}^{n_{f}} \left\{ \frac{i}{2} \bar{\psi}_{q} \quad \overleftrightarrow{\phi} \psi_{q} - m_{q} \quad \bar{\psi}_{q} \quad \psi_{q} + g_{s} \bar{\psi}_{q} \quad A^{a} T^{a} \quad \psi_{q} \right\}$$

gauge group generators  $T^a$  and structure constants  $f^{abc}$  fulfill  $\left[ T^a , T^b \right] = i f^{abc} T^c$ 

	fermion rep.		adjoint rep.	(gluon)
Dimensions:		$\delta_{ii} = d_F$		$\delta_{aa} = N_A$
Traces:		$Tr \begin{pmatrix} T^a & T^b \end{pmatrix} = T_F \ \delta^{ab}$		
Casimir operators:	i	$T^a_{ik} T^a_{kj} = C_F \delta_{ij}$	a	$-f^{acd}f^{cdb} = C_A \delta_{ab}$

#### **II.** Extension of QCD to reducible fermion representations

$$\mathcal{L}_{QCD} = -\frac{1}{4} G^{a}_{\mu\nu} G^{a\,\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{2(1-\xi)} \left(\partial_{\mu} A^{a\,\mu}\right)^{2} + \partial_{\mu} \bar{c}^{a} \partial^{\mu} c^{a} + g_{s} f^{abc} \partial_{\mu} \bar{c}^{a} A^{b\,\mu} c^{c} + \sum_{r=1}^{N_{\text{rep}}} \sum_{q=1}^{n_{f,r}} \left\{ \frac{i}{2} \bar{\psi}_{q,r} \overleftrightarrow{\partial} \psi_{q,r} - m_{q,r} \bar{\psi}_{q,r} \psi_{q,r} + g_{s} \bar{\psi}_{q,r} A^{a} T^{a,r} \psi_{q,r} \right\}$$

gauge group generators  $T^{a,r}$  and structure constants  $f^{abc}$  fulfill  $\left[T^{a,r}, T^{b,r}\right] = i f^{abc} T^{c,r}$ 

	fermion rep.	$r \in \{1, \dots, N_{rep}\}$	adjoint rep.	(gluon)
Dimensions:		$\delta_{ii} = d_{F,r}$		$\delta_{aa} = N_A$
Traces:		${\sf Tr}\left(T^{a,r}T^{b,r} ight)=T_{F,r}\delta^{ab}$		
Casimir operators:	i j	$T^{a,r}_{ik}T^{a,r}_{kj} = C_{F,r}\delta_{ij}$		$-f^{acd}f^{cdb} = C_A \delta_{ab}$

#### **Example with** $N_{rep} = 2$ : **QCD** plus gluinos (Majorana fermions)

Calculation can be done with Dirac fermion propagator, provided a factor  $\frac{1}{2}$  is introduced in closed gluino loops (along with the usual (-1) for fermion loops) [Denner, Eck, Hahn, Küblbeck (1992); Clavelli, Coulter, Surguladze (1996)]

$$\overbrace{a \quad b}^{c} = \underbrace{i}_{p-\underline{m}_{\tilde{g}}} \delta^{ab} \qquad \qquad \overbrace{b}^{c} = (i\gamma^{\mu}) \left(-i \underbrace{f}_{=(T^{c,A})_{ab}}^{abc}\right)$$

 $\mathbf{\Omega}$ 

 $\Rightarrow$ 

$$a \sim C_A \frac{n_{\tilde{g}}}{2} \delta^{ab}$$

7

## **III.** Renormalization Group (RG) functions in QFT

Evolution of any parameter or field  $\Phi$  with the renormalization scale  $\mu$  described by the anomalous dimension  $\gamma_{\Phi}$ , evolution of coupling  $\alpha_s = \frac{g_s^2}{4\pi}$  described by  $\beta$ -function:

$$\mu^2 \frac{d}{d\mu^2} \Phi = \gamma_\Phi \Phi \qquad \qquad \mu^2 \frac{d}{d\mu^2} \alpha_s = \gamma_{\alpha_s} \alpha_s = \beta(\alpha_s)$$

7

In  $D = 4 - 2\varepsilon$  space-time dimensions:

$$\alpha_s^{\text{bare}} = Z_{\alpha_s} \alpha_s \mu^{2\varepsilon} \implies \beta^{(D)}(\alpha_s) = \mu^2 \frac{d\alpha_s}{d\mu^2} = -\varepsilon \alpha_s + \beta(\alpha_s),$$
  
$$\Phi^{\text{bare}} = Z_{\Phi} \Phi \quad \text{with} \quad Z_{\Phi}(\alpha_s, \xi) = 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{z^{(n)}(\alpha_s, \xi)}{\varepsilon^n}$$

$$\left[\mu^2 \frac{d}{d\mu^2} \left\{ \alpha_s^{\text{bare}}, \Phi^{\text{bare}} \right\} = 0 \right] \Rightarrow \qquad \gamma_\Phi(\alpha_s, \xi) = -\mu^2 \frac{d \log Z_\Phi(\alpha_s, \xi)}{d\mu^2} = \alpha_s \frac{\partial z^{(1)}(\alpha_s, \xi)}{\partial \alpha_s}$$

$$\beta(\alpha_s) = \alpha_s \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \beta_{\alpha_s}^{(n)} \left(\frac{\alpha_s}{4\pi}\right)^n,$$
  
$$\gamma_{\Phi}(\alpha_s, \xi) = -\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \gamma^{(n)}(\xi) \left(\frac{\alpha_s}{4\pi}\right)^n$$

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{L}_{_{QCD}}^{_{\text{bare}}} &= -\frac{1}{4} Z_{3}^{(2g)} \left( \partial_{\mu} A_{\nu}^{a} - \partial_{\nu} A_{\mu}^{a} \right)^{2} - \frac{1}{2(1-\xi)} \left( \partial_{\mu} A^{a\,\mu} \right)^{2} - \frac{1}{2} Z_{1}^{(3g)} g_{s} f^{abc} \left( \partial_{\mu} A_{\nu}^{a} - \partial_{\nu} A_{\mu}^{a} \right) A_{\mu}^{b} A_{\nu}^{c} \\ &- \frac{1}{4} Z_{1}^{(4g)} g_{s}^{2} \left( f^{abc} A_{\mu}^{b} A_{\nu}^{c} \right)^{2} + Z_{3}^{(2c)} \partial_{\mu} \bar{c}^{a} \partial^{\mu} c^{a} + Z_{1}^{(ccg)} g_{s} f^{abc} \partial_{\mu} \bar{c}^{a} A^{b\,\mu} c^{c} \\ &+ \sum_{r=1}^{N_{\text{rep}}} \sum_{q=1}^{n_{f,r}} \left\{ Z_{2}^{(q,r)} \frac{i}{2} \bar{\psi}_{q,r} \overleftrightarrow{\phi} \psi_{q,r} - m_{q,r} Z_{m}^{(q,r)} Z_{2}^{(q,r)} \bar{\psi}_{q,r} \psi_{q,r} + g_{s} Z_{1}^{(q,r)} \bar{\psi}_{q,r} A^{a} T^{a,r} \psi_{q,r} \right\}, \end{split}$$

Slavnov-Taylor identities ensure





## $\beta_{\alpha_s}$ at 4 loop from the ghost-gluon-vertex

## **Computation of Renormalization constants: massive approach**

[Misiak and Münz (1995); Larin, van Ritbergen, Vermaseren (1996); Chetyrkin, Misiak and Münz (1998)]

• Introduce the same auxiliary mass  $M^2$  in every propagator denominator:

 $\frac{1}{(q+p)^2} \rightarrow \frac{1}{(q+p)^2 - M^2}$ . (p external, q internal momenta)

- Expand in external momenta p in order to factor out tree-level momentum structure, e. g. p/p,  $p^{\mu}$ ,  $p^{2}$ ,  $(p^{\mu}p^{\nu} - p^{2}g^{\mu\nu}) \Rightarrow$  massive tadpole integrals with one scale  $M^{2}$ .
- Introduce  $M^2$ -counterterm  $\left| \frac{M^2}{2} \delta Z_{M^2} \left( A^a_\mu A^{a\,\mu} \right) \right|$  to cancel subdivergences  $\propto M^2$ :



 $\Rightarrow$  only UV part computed correctly!

#### **Automation**

- Generation of diagrams  $\rightarrow$  QGRAF [Noguira]
- gauge group factors → COLOR [van Ritbergen, Schellekens, Vermaseren] extended to allow for different fermion representations [M.Z.]
- Feynman integrals:
  - find topologies  $\rightarrow$  Q2E, EXP [Seidesticker, Harlander, Steinhauser]
  - Feynman rules, projectors, counterterms, fermion traces, expansion in external momenta  $\rightarrow$  FORM [Vermaseren] code [Chetyrkin, M.Z.]
  - − massive tadpole integrals → up to 3 loop: MATAD [Steinhauser]; Reduction at 4 loop: FIRE5 (C++ version) [Smirnov] (based on IBP) ⇒ use 19 Master integrals [Czakon et al]
  - L-loop UV-part for fermion and ghost propagators and vertices with full ξ-dependence from the UV and finite part of massless (L-1)-loop propagators [Chetyrkin]; computed with MINCER [Vermaseren]

#### The COLOR algorithm [Van Ritbergen, Schellekens, Vermaseren] extended

• 
$$a_4 \otimes (r) \otimes a_1 \rightarrow \operatorname{Tr}(T^{a_1,r}T^{a_2,r} \dots T^{a_n,r})$$
  
• simplify using relations like  $\left( \begin{array}{c} & & \\ c & & \\ \end{array} \right) = T^{a,r}T^{b,r}T^{c,r} = C_{F,r}T^{a,r}T^{c,r}$ 

• Write result in terms of symmetrized traces  $d_{r}^{a_{1}a_{2}...a_{n}} = \frac{1}{n!} \sum_{\pi} \operatorname{Tr} \left\{ T^{a_{\pi(1)},r} T^{a_{\pi(2)},r} \dots T^{a_{\pi(n)},r} \right\} :$   $\operatorname{Tr} \left( T^{a_{1},r} \dots T^{a_{n},r} \right) = \operatorname{Tr} \left( T^{a_{1},r} \dots T^{a_{n},r} \right) - \frac{1}{n!} \sum_{\pi} \underbrace{\operatorname{Tr} \left\{ T^{a_{\pi(1)},r} \dots T^{a_{\pi(n)},r} \right\}}_{\operatorname{use}} + d_{r}^{a_{1}...a_{n}} + d_{r}^{a_{1}...a_{n}}$   $= \operatorname{tr} \left( T^{a_{1},r} \dots T^{a_{n},r} \right) + \operatorname{shorter traces} \left[ T^{a_{r},r}, T^{b,r} \right] = i f^{abc} T^{c,r} \text{ to write as } \operatorname{Tr} \left( T^{a_{1},r} \dots T^{a_{n},r} \right) + \operatorname{shorter traces} \left[ T^{a_{1},r} \dots T^{a_{n},r} \right] + \operatorname{shorter traces} \left[ T^{a_{1},r} \dots T^{a_{n},r} \right] + \operatorname{shorter traces} \left[ T^{a_{1},r} (T^{a_{1},r} \dots T^{a_{n},r}) + \operatorname{shorter traces} \left[ T^{a_{1},r} (T^{a_{1},r} \dots T^{a_{n},r}) + T^{a_{n},r} \right] \right] = d_{r}^{a_{1}a_{2}a_{3}} + \frac{i}{2} f^{a_{1}a_{2}a_{3}} T_{r,r};$   $\operatorname{continue to draw out} C_{r,r}, T_{r,r}, C_{A} \text{ if possible.}$ 

• Adjoint traces with  $(T^{a,A})_{bc} = -if^{abc}$  reduced via the same procedure and the relation

$$f^{a_1 a b} f^{a_2 b c} f^{a_3 c a} = \frac{C_A}{2} f^{a_1 a_2 a_3}.$$

 $\Rightarrow$  Final result in terms of invariants  $C_{F,r}, T_{F,r}, C_A$  and contractions of the  $d_r^{a_1...a_n}$ , e. g.  $d_A^{(4)} = \frac{d_A^{abcd} d_A^{abcd}}{N_A}$ .

#### **Color factors for several fermion representations**

1. Use one field A for the adjoint representation and one field  $\psi$  for all the fermion representations in QGRAF. Number of diagrams to be computed same as in QCD!



For each fermion line use a separate "line representation"  $T^{a,R1}, T^{a,R2}, T^{a,R3}, T^{a,R4}$ . <u>After evaluation with COLOR</u> substitute color factor from each fermion loop by sum over all physical representations and flavours:  $\mathbf{Tr} \left( T^{a_1,R1}T^{a_2,R1} \dots T^{a_n,R1} \right) \rightarrow \sum_r n_{f,r} \mathbf{Tr} \left( T^{a_1,r}T^{a_2,r} \dots T^{a_n,r} \right).$ 

#### **Renormalization procedure**



Trick for cancellation of subdivergences: Use explicit sum of group representations (as many as can appear in a single diagram), e. g.  $T_{F,R_i} \rightarrow n_{f,1}T_{F,1} + n_{f,2}T_{F,2} + n_{f,3}T_{F,3} + n_{f,4}T_{F,4}$ .

This ensures that e. g. 1-loop counterterm from  $\mathbb{Z}$  inserted in  $\rightarrow$  cancels the subdivergencies of the R3 and R4 loop in the above diagram.



2.b) After cancellation of subdivergencies by lower-loop diagrams with counterterm insertions collect color factors in sums of terms over all physical representations r,

e.g. 
$$\left| n_{f,1}T_{F,1} \rightarrow \sum_{r} n_{f,r}T_{F,r} - n_{f,2}T_{F,2} - n_{f,3}T_{F,3} - n_{f,4}T_{F,4} \right|$$

IV. Results:  $\beta_{\alpha_s}$  with different fermion representations

$$\begin{split} \beta_{\alpha_s}^{(1)} &= -\frac{11}{3}C_A + \frac{4}{3}\sum_i n_{f,i}T_{F,i} \\ \beta_{\alpha_s}^{(4)} &= -\left(\frac{150653}{486} - \frac{44}{9}\zeta_3\right)C_A^4 + \left(\frac{80}{9} - \frac{704}{3}\zeta_3\right)\frac{d_A^{abcd}d_A^{abcd}}{N_A} \\ &+ \sum_i n_{f,i}\left\{T_{F,i}\left[-46C_{F,i}^3 + \left(\frac{4204}{27} - \frac{352}{9}\zeta_3\right)C_AC_{F,i}^2 - \left(\frac{7073}{243} - \frac{656}{9}\zeta_3\right)C_A^2C_{F,i}\right. \\ &+ \left(\frac{39143}{81} - \frac{136}{3}\zeta_3\right)C_A^3\right] - \left(\frac{512}{9} - \frac{1664}{3}\zeta_3\right)\frac{d_{F,i}^{abcd}d_A^{abcd}}{N_A}\right\} \\ &+ \sum_i n_{f,i}n_{f,j}\left\{T_{F,i}T_{F,j}\left[-\left(\frac{184}{3} - 64\zeta_3\right)C_{F,i}C_{F,j} + \left(\frac{304}{27} + \frac{128}{9}\zeta_3\right)C_{F,i}^2\right. \\ &- \left(\frac{17152}{243}C_AC_{F,i} + \frac{448}{9}\zeta_3\right)C_AC_{F,i} - \left(\frac{7930}{81} + \frac{224}{9}\zeta_3\right)C_A^2\right] \\ &+ \left(\frac{704}{9} - \frac{512}{3}\zeta_3\right)\frac{d_{F,i}^{abcd}d_{F,j}^{abcd}}{N_A}\right\} \\ &- \sum_{i,j,k} n_{f,i}n_{f,j}n_{f,k}T_{F,i}T_{F,j}T_{F,k}\left[\frac{1232}{243}C_{F,i} + \frac{424}{243}C_A\right] \\ \hline i, j, k \text{ summed over all fermion representations of the gauge group.} \qquad \text{in MS-scheme} \end{split}$$

# Anomalous dimension $\gamma_2^{(q,r)}$ of fermion of flavour q in representation r:

$$\begin{split} \gamma_{2}^{(q,r)} \Big)^{(1)} &= C_{F,r} \\ \gamma_{2}^{(q,r)} \Big)^{(4)} &\stackrel{!}{=} -C_{F,r}^{4} \left( \frac{1027}{8} + 400\zeta_{3} - 640\zeta_{5} \right) + C_{A}C_{F,r}^{3} \left( \frac{5131}{12} + 848\zeta_{3} - 1440\zeta_{5} \right) \\ &- C_{A}^{2}C_{F,r}^{2} \left( \frac{23777}{36} + 214\zeta_{3} + 66\zeta_{4} - 790\zeta_{5} \right) + C_{A}^{3}C_{F,r} \left( \frac{10059589}{15552} \right) \\ &- \frac{1489}{24}\zeta_{3} + \frac{173}{4}\zeta_{4} - \frac{1865}{12}\zeta_{5} \right) - \frac{d_{F,r}^{abcd}}{d_{F,r}} \left( 66 - 190\zeta_{3} + 170\zeta_{5} \right) \\ &+ \sum_{i} n_{f,i} \left\{ T_{F,i}C_{F,r} \left[ 3C_{F,i}^{2} + C_{F,r}C_{F,i} \left( 62 - 48\zeta_{3} \right) - C_{F,r}^{2} \left( \frac{119}{3} + 16\zeta_{3} \right) \right. \\ &- C_{A}C_{F,i} \left( \frac{2945}{12} - 156\zeta_{3} - 12\zeta_{4} \right) + C_{A}C_{F,r} \left( \frac{1607}{9} - 112\zeta_{3} + 24\zeta_{4} \right) \\ &+ 160\zeta_{5} \right) - C_{A}^{2} \left( \frac{1365691}{3888} + \frac{119}{3}\zeta_{3} + 25\zeta_{4} + 80\zeta_{5} \right) \right] + 128 \frac{d_{F,r}^{abcd}d_{F,i}^{abcd}}{d_{F,r}} \right\} \\ &- \sum_{i,j} n_{f,i}n_{f,j}T_{F,i}T_{F,j}C_{F,r} \left[ \frac{92}{9}C_{F,r} - C_{F,j} \left( 44 - 32\zeta_{3} \right) \right] \\ &- C_{A} \left( \frac{6835}{243} + \frac{112}{3}\zeta_{3} \right) \right] + \frac{280}{81}C_{F,r} \sum_{i,j,k} n_{f,i}n_{f,j}n_{f,k}T_{F,i}T_{F,j}T_{F,k} \end{split}$$

Here  $\xi = 0$ . Full  $\xi$ -dependence (in Mathematica file)  $\rightarrow$  source files of arXiv:1704.04209

# V. Summary

- Complete set of 4 loop renormalization constants, anomalous dimensions and  $\beta$ -function for any simple gauge group model with one coupling and any number of fermion representations presented, full  $\xi$ -dependence.
- Color factors in these results make contributions of individual diagram topologies more transparent as compared to QCD: Each fermion line comes with a gauge group representation index (C<sub>F</sub> → C<sub>F,i</sub> etc) summed over in loops and free in open lines.
- Application in a large group of SM extensions, e. g. in supersymmetric models. Example: QCD plus gluinos.
- COLOR [van Ritbergen, Schellekens, Vermaseren] package (FORM) extended to allow for any number of fermion representations of the gauge group → Can be applied in other calculations.

# BACKUP

#### Motivation of calculation of UV part with massive tadpoles

Exact decomposition of all propagator denominators:

$$\frac{1}{(q+p)^2} = \frac{1}{q^2 - M^2} + \frac{-p^2 - 2q \cdot p - M^2}{q^2 - M^2} \frac{1}{(q+p)^2}$$

(p external, q internal momenta)

Recursion:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{(q+p)^2} = & \frac{1}{q^2 - M^2} + \frac{-p^2 - 2q \cdot p}{(q^2 - M^2)^2} + \frac{(-p^2 - 2q \cdot p)^2}{(q^2 - M^2)^3} \\ & - \frac{M^2}{(q^2 - M^2)^2} + \frac{M^2(M^2 + 2p^2 + 4q \cdot p)}{(q^2 - M^2)^3} \\ & + \frac{(-p^2 - 2q \cdot p - M^2)^3}{(q^2 - M^2)^3} \frac{1}{(q+p)^2} \end{aligned}$$

Result independent of  $M^2 \Rightarrow$  omit terms  $\sim M^2$ ; Introduce counterterms to cancel  $M^2$  dependent subdivergences.