



Some Issues with New Hires for the Last Two Years

Harry Cheung (FCSA Chair – 2023-2024 Term)

SAC Meeting – May 16, 2024

Introduction to the Fermilab Committee for Scientific Appointments

FCSA reviews the hiring, promotion and term extensions for scientific staff. FCSA does not review the hiring of Wilson and Peoples fellows or promotions from senior scientist to distinguished scientist, both of which are subject to separate procedures. FCSA evaluates candidates using the guidelines supplied in the Policy on Scientific Appointments. The committee acts in an advisory capacity to the Fermilab director.

FCSA members are appointed by the Fermilab director. The committee consists of Fermilab scientists who serve staggered three-year terms. (Currently 15.) The Fermilab director also appoints nonvoting members of FCSA, such as the **committee's secretary (Hank Glass)** and a liaison to HR (**Matt Jabczynski – Talent Acquisition**). The Fermilab director ensures that the membership is diverse and broadly representative of the lab's programs.

The procedure for FCSA is given in the policy documents. When the Hiring Manager or Division/Section Head decides on an offer/promotion/extension, Hank receives a packet for the candidate and notifies FCSA. The Chair forms a Fact-Finding team that evaluates the candidate using guidelines supplied in the Lab's Policy on Scientific Appointments. The Fact-Finding team presents its findings to the full committee and a votes to recommend an action to the Director. The recommendation is then sent to the Director. The Director responds to FCSA with the decision.

Data on Past New Hires from the last ~2 Years

In Purple – Person started in Job before Director approves FCSA recommendation

In Yellow – Targeted Hire

	B	C	D	E	F	G	I	N	O	P	Q	
3	Level	Division	Info packet sent to FCSA	Recommendation voted on in FCSA meeting	Recommendation letter sent to Director	Director approves FCSA recommendation		Offer Delivered	Offer Accepted	Start date	Does offer letter contain FCSA clause.	
4	Assoc. Sci.	PPD	12/10/21	12/22/21	12/23/21	1/14/22	Nigel	N/A	N/A	2/1/2-22	N/A	I do not have any info
5	Sr. Sci.	AD	12/15/21	1/27/22	1/28/22	2/11/22		2/16/22	2/20/22	6/6/22	No	No information on if this wa
6	Assoc. Sci.	SQMS	3/9/22	3/23/22	3/25/22	3/31/22		4/11/22	4/12/22	4/1/22	Yes	Internal - targeted hire
7	Assoc. Sci.	ND	3/17/22	4/6/22	4/7/22	4/8/22		8/2/22	N/A	8/15/22	N/A	Internal - Promotion - This p
8	Assoc. Sci.	SQMS	4/25/22	5/18/22	5/23/22	5/24/22	Lia	6/8/22	6/21/22	9/1/22	Yes	Targeted hire
9	Assoc. Sci.	AD	5/17/22	6/1/22	6/6/22	6/7/22		6/9/22	6/9/22	7/18/22	Yes	Competitive hire
10	Assoc. Sci.	SCD	6/17/22	9/14/22	9/19/22	9/22/22		4/6/22	4/19/22	4/25/22	Yes	Internal - Targeted hire
11	Sr. Sci.	THD	8/22/22	8/31/22	8/31/22	8/31/22		8/10/22	8/18/22	9/1/22	Yes	Targeted hire
12	Sr. Sci.	ND	1/19/23	2/13/23	2/14/23	2/17/23		4/3/23	6/6/23	9/5/23	Yes	Targeted hire
13	Assoc. Sci.	SQMS	1/20/23	3/6/23	3/13/23	3/15/23		1/20/23	1/20/23	3/6/23	No	Internal - Targeted Hire
14	Assoc. Sci.	SQMS	1/20/23	2/27/23	3/3/23	3/4/23		2/7/23	2/7/23	7/24/23	Yes	Targeted hire
15	Assoc. Sci.	AD	1/25/23	3/6/23	3/13/23	3/15/23		1/27/23	2/1/23	3/13/23	Yes	Competitive hire
16	Assoc. Sci.	AD	1/27/23	3/20/23	3/24/23	3/27/23		2/10/23	2/13/23	2/20/23	Yes	Targeted hire
17	Assoc. Sci.	AD	9/12/23	10/16/23	10/17/23			9/25/23	10/9/23	10/30/23	No	Competitive hire
18	Sr. Sci.	AD	12/6/23	1/8/24	1/9/24	1/10/24		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Competitive hire
19	Scientist	AD	2/1/24	2/26/24	3/1/24	3/7/24		2/15/24	2/15/24	3/18/24	Yes	Competitive hire

In Red – Job offer sent before Director approves FCSA recommendation
 In Red – Job offer sent before FCSA recommendation sent to Director
 In Red – Job offer sent before FCSA voted on its recommendation
 In Red – Job offer sent before FCSA received candidate's info packet



Targeted Hires in Policy Documents

- Fermilab I Director's Policy Manual I No. 22.000 Fermilab Scientific Appointments
 - “Targeted hires, e.g. where there is a need for critical or unique skills, for both term and non-term scientific appointments can be subject to expedited searches, with the approval of the Director.”
- Fermilab I Director's Policy Manual I No. 22.000 Fermilab Scientific Appointments I Scientific Search and Hiring Procedure
 - “In the case of targeted hires, where there is no search, the steps involving advertising, searching, and interviewing can clearly be skipped, but there should still be a summarizing letter written at the end by the hiring manager.”

This Data was Presented to Lia on 4/12/24

- 20 Mins with Hank, Harry, Matt, Kristin: Focus only on problem in new hire timelines
 - Data collected by Hank and Matt - Thanks to them! Shows the extent of the problem
 - Lia expressed concern that “it looks bad” and we need to do something about it
 - Showed we have a large fraction of targeted hires and there is insufficient guidance in the current policy (e.g. diversity, who chooses the candidate, requirements, oversight,...)
 - Lia agreed we need to update the policy and support HR/FCSA working on it
- Next Steps: We will revise the agreement between FCOSA, HR, Hiring Manager, Director’s Office and send to Lia
 - Include more communication, better hand-shaking at milestones, and include targeted hires in a integrated way instead of a rare exception, including explicate procedure for involvement of FCOSA earlier in the process for targeted hires. Allow targeted hires but try to avoid disadvantages that can occur.
- Next Steps: We will make recommendations for Targeted Hire Policy
 - Involving SAC, finding out what other DOE Labs do (Matt), and what (some) universities do

Next Steps – What Do Universities Do?

- FSU, from one professor:
 - "There is not an overall university policy on targeted hires (I think at FSU we would use the words 'opportunity hire' for the case where a high-quality candidate becomes known to the department outside of a regularly scheduled search). Some departments have this covered in their bylaws (how to structure an ad hoc search committee for an opportunity hire) but our physics department does not. See for example section E.3 of [1] from the Chemistry department. The only opportunity hires we have made since I came to the department have been significant others or cases where we did have a search but elected to try for more than one of the candidates. How it really works is that the dean of the college has a pool of money for this which can be used at his discretion. The size of this pool relative to the rest of faculty salaries is part of the collective bargaining agreement between the faculty union and the administration. It is up to the hiring department to make the case to the dean that the opportunity is special enough to use up this limited resource."
- Vanderbilt, from one professor:
 - "Saying there was a policy is rather generous, I think we usually try to identify a candidate and make a case to a dean. Sometimes it really helps if they are a minority or other underrepresented person, and this help can occur if the chancellor says they have some funds for this."
- Anecdotal comments from some FCSA members about targeted hires at universities:
 - Targeted hires are more difficult to get, the process takes longer than a competitive hire, and the candidate needs to meet a higher standard than normal; It is not be used to circumvent job hiring restrictions.

Next Steps – What Do Other DOE Labs Do?

- Matt has gotten some replies from other DOE laboratories
 - “We identify there is a need for review and update to the targeted hire process and that Matt is now going to work with HR leadership, FCSEA leadership and Lia to develop and roll out a plan and communication to Fermilab on any non-competitive hiring practices or targeted hiring”.